
MODULE THREE

Grading Guidelines

PAF 101 EXERCISES: MODULE THREE BASED ON CHAPTERS 5 & 6

**** Whenever you use a source in your answer, including all quotes, you must provide an APA-style internal citation and a full APA-style reference in the References page exercise, except when using a personal communication. HINT: Most of these exercises require citations.**

**** Whenever you attach an article, it must be directly behind the exercise in which it is first used, and it must be clearly labeled with the exercise numbers and letters to which it pertains. Attach only the first page of the article unless otherwise stated.**

Exercise 5.1: Describing the Societal Problem and its Geographic Location
Your Total Score: _____ (Maximum: 8 points)

A. Briefly state your societal problem and which local area of the country it applies to (i.e. town, city, county, school district). For this module, your geographic level must be local. (2 points)

Part A score: _____

- **State your societal problem here:**
 - ***Deduct 20 points off the entire paper if the societal problem is very wrong. Then, grade the rest of the paper as if it is correct. For example, if the policy is just for Syracuse University, take off 20 points.***
 - *Deduct 1 point if the societal problem is not stated by making a comment that something is too high or too low (or something similar).*
 - *Deduct 1 point if the problem is not a societal problem.*
 - *Funding is NOT a societal problem.*
 - *Problems with policies do NOT make good societal problems. Ex. If a student doesn't like an aspect of No Child Left Behind, it does not make it alright for a societal problem.*

- **State the specific geographic area you will be focusing on here:**

- *Deduct 1 point if the area stated is incorrect. It must be local: a county, town, village, city, or school district. Note: Onondaga County is NOT a school district.*

B. Clearly describe two of the most significant negative effects of the problem. (6 points)

Part B score: _____

- **Describe the first negative effect here:**

- **Describe the second negative effect here:**

- *Deduct 3 points for each negative effect that is incorrect, unrealistic, or illogical, or if the two are redundant.*
- *Deduct up to 2 points each if the student does not clearly describe the effects.*

Exercise 5.2: Providing Evidence of a Societal Problem within the County of your Choosing
Your Total Score: _____ (Maximum: 21 points)

Provide three different forms of clear and convincing evidence of the societal problem identified in Exercise 5.1. Specify the geographic locality that each piece of evidence is from, which should be the same locality as you identified in 5.1. If the evidence is from another geographic location, clearly describe why the evidence could be applied to the specific locality you chose in Exercise 5.1

- Write up to 4 sentences describing each piece of evidence. (7 points each)
 - Label graphs and tables. Make sure it conforms to p. 61, figure 5.2 of the *Maxwell Manual* - one point will be deducted for each format error.
- For each piece of evidence:
 - Deduct 5 points if evidence is for a different geographic area as stated in 5.1 and no justification is given. Justification may include, but is not limited to stating the data showing that the problem exists in the State of New York is evidence that the problem likely exists in Onondaga County.
 - Deduct 7 points if the evidence provided is not relevant to the problem.
 - Deduct 2 points for each missing internal citation. Deduct 1 from WRT if the internal citation is incorrect.
 - Deduct 2 points from the References page for each missing reference. Each source for each piece of evidence must have a reference except for a personal communication (personal communication only appears internally).
 - Deduct 2-4 points if the evidence is redundant or if the student's explanation of what data shows or proves in terms of a problem is inaccurate or unreasonable.
 - Deduct 2 points if any piece of evidence is provided but not clearly explained.
 - Deduct 3 points if the student writes more than 4 sentences.
- **Write up to 4 sentences providing evidence of your societal problem and support this evidence by including a trend line graph. At least one point on the graph must be factual, and the graph must contain a minimum of three data points. (Note: graph must be generated electronically and may not be hand drawn):**
- The graph must have a title, a label of each axis, and a source listed. The format must follow the format in Figure 5.1 on page 59 of the Maxwell Manual.

- *Deduct 1 point for the following errors: no title (must state the years), axis is not labeled (-2 points if neither x or y is labeled), no source, if gridlines and/or background color on graph, if estimated year is not labeled*
- *Deduct 7 points if no points on the graph are factual (if all are estimated).*
- *If graph contains color do not deduct any points*

- **Write a up to 4 sentences providing evidence based on a quote from a player, stakeholder, or expert you interviewed here (include the direct quote that supports the evidence):**

- *Deduct 7 points if this piece of evidence is not based on a quote from a player, stakeholder, or expert.*
- *Deduct 3 points if the paragraph does not provide a direct quote from the player.*

- **Write up to 4 sentences providing evidence by citing a print or electronic source here:**

- *Deduct 7 points if the evidence is not based on a citation from a print or electronic source.*
- *Deduct 1 point if no justification*
- *Deduct 7 points if it is not evidence.*

Exercise 5.3: Identifying Underlying Causes of the Problem

Your Total Score: _____ (Maximum: 12 points)

Describe and provide sources for the four most significant causes that contribute to the existence of the societal problem which you are studying. (NOTE: the causes and sources used can be general & not specific to the local area.) The causes should not overlap or be redundant.

- One source may be used for several or all of the causes, and at least one of the four must be based on a quote from a player, stakeholder, or expert you have interviewed (7 points will be deducted if you do not do this).
- 3 points will be deducted if a major cause is not discussed and full credit will be assigned only if reasonable causes are included and the discussion is clearly and precisely written.

- *Deduct 7 points if a player, stakeholder, or expert is not a source.*
- *Deduct 3 points if cause listed is incorrect.*
- *Deduct 2-3 points if cause listed is trivial, or if a significant cause was omitted, depending on how significant the cause is. Do not take off points because you can think of another cause left out, unless it is a major one. Do not simply say, "I'm sure you can think of better causes."*
- *Deduct 2 points if cause is stated but not clearly explained.*
- *Deduct 4 points if two causes are the same or close to the same.*
- *Deduct 3 points if obvious cause is omitted (for instance, if their problem is crime and they don't list drugs as a cause).*

- **Write and briefly describe the first cause here:**
- **Write and briefly describe the second cause here:**
- **Write and briefly describe the third cause here:**
- **Write and briefly describe the fourth cause here:**

- *Deduct 2 points for each missing internal citation. Deduct 1 from WRT if the internal citation is incorrect.*
- *Deduct 2 points from the References page for each missing reference. Each source for each piece of evidence must have a reference except for a personal communication (personal communication only appears internally).*

Exercise 5.4: Describing the Current Policy

Your Total Score: _____ (Maximum: 8 points)

A. Describe one current policy now in effect in the locality you specified in 5.1 to remedy the problem described in 5.1. The policy can originate at a local, state, or national level but must be operating in all or part of the locality you have chosen. Be clear where it originates. (2 points)

Part A score: _____

- **Describe the policy here:**

- *Deduct 2 points if policy is not currently in effect in all or part of Onondaga County or their geographic location.*
- *Deduct 1 point if the policy is stated and not described, or if it is not described clearly.*

- **Write the specific geographic location the policy originated in here:**

- *Deduct 1 point if student is incorrect about the level of government.*

B. Identify the local administrative unit primarily responsible for implementing the policy. (2 points)

Part B score: _____

- **Identify the local administrative unit here:**

- *Deduct 1 point if administrative unit is incorrect.*
- *Deduct 2 points if unit listed is not an administrative unit.*

- **State the geographic location over which the administrative unit has the authority to act:**

- *Deduct 1 point if geographic location is incorrect.*

C. Identify the legislative body that is the original source of this policy. (2 points)

Part C score: _____

- **Identify the legislative body here:**

- *Deduct 1 point if legislative body is incorrect.*
- *Deduct 2 points if unit listed is not a legislative body*

- **State the geographic location over which the legislative body has the authority to act:**

- *Deduct 1 point if geographic location is incorrect.*

D. Describe how a court at any level (local, state, federal) could be involved in the application of the policy. (2 points)

Part D score: _____

- **Describe how a court could be involved here:**

- *Deduct 1 point if student's description of court involvement is incorrect.*
- *Deduct 2 points if the student says there is no court involvement ONLY if you can think of a specific way the courts CAN be involved.*
- *Deduct 2 points if the student's description does not deal with the judicial branch of government (at any level).*

- **State the geographic jurisdiction of the court(s):**

- *Deduct 1 point if the geographic location of the court's jurisdiction is incorrect.*

Exercise 5.5: Describing the Role of Business and Non-Profit Organizations

Your Total Score: _____ (Maximum: 6 points)

A. Identify a business corporation and describe an action it takes to reduce the societal problem you are studying at any geographic level, not necessarily your chosen locality. (3 points)

Part A score: _____

- **Write the name and location of the corporate headquarters of the business here:**
- **In one sentence, indicate the action this corporation takes to reduce the societal problem by quoting a statement either from the company itself or another source here:**

- *Deduct 3 points if anything in Part A is incorrect, except for the internal citation.*
- *Deduct 2 points if no quote is included*
- *Deduct 1 point if it is more than one sentence.*
- *Deduct 2 points from the exercise if there is no internal citation.*
- *Deduct 1 point from writing if the internal citation is incorrect.*
- *Deduct 2 points from the References page if reference is missing.*

B. Identify a non-profit organization and describe an action it takes to reduce the societal problem you are studying at any geographic level, not necessarily your chosen locality. (3 points)

Part B score: _____

- **Write the name and location of the local or national headquarters of the non-profit organization here:**
- **In one sentence, describe the action the organization takes to reduce the societal problem by quoting a statement either from the organization or another source here:**

- *Deduct 3 points if anything in Part B is incorrect, except for the internal citation.*
- *Deduct 2 points if no quote is included*
- *Deduct 1 point if it is more than one sentence.*
- *Deduct 2 points from the exercise if there is no internal citation.*
- *Deduct 1 point from writing if the internal citation is incorrect.*
- *Deduct 2 points from the References page if reference is missing.*

Exercise 5.6: Examining the News Media's Discussion of Societal Problems

Your Total Score: _____ (Maximum: 6 points)

Select and evaluate an editorial, op-ed, or letter to the editor from any newspaper published within the past six months that discusses your societal problem at any governmental level or location. Do not summarize the article. Attach a copy of the entire article directly behind this exercise.

- **Evaluate how well the author presents the “societal problem,” “evidence of the problem,” and “causes of the problem,” and quote at least one sentence or part of it from the article here:**

- *Deduct 5 points if the student only summarizes the article and does not evaluate how well the author presents the problem.*
- *Deduct up to 5 points for a poor response that fails to evaluate the definition, evidence, and causes of the problem.*
- *Deduct 1 point if the evaluation does not include a quote from the article.*
- *Deduct 2 points from the exercise if there is no internal citation.*
- *Deduct 1 point from writing if the internal citation is incorrect.*
- *Deduct 2 points from the References page if reference is missing.*
- *Deduct 6 points for the following reasons:*
 - *No article is attached.*
 - *Only the first page of the article is attached.*
 - *The article is not an editorial, op-ed, or letter to the editor.*
 - *The article is published before stated date.*
- *Deduct 1 organization point if the article is not clearly labeled.*

Exercise 6.1: Evaluating the Grading Exercise and Increasing Learning

Your Total Score: _____ (Maximum: 6 points)

Identify and justify in one sentence which of the three grading options would be most **feasible** in future PAF 101 classes. In another sentence, identify and justify which of the three grading options you think would be most **effective** in promoting learning in future PAF 101 classes. You must choose between the traditional, conservative, or socialist grading options or you will receive no points for this exercise.

- **Write one sentence for which option would be most feasible here:**

- *Deduct 3 points if this sentence does not deal with feasibility.*
- *Deduct up to 2 points for a weak justification, depending on how poor it is.*
- *Deduct 1 point if more than one sentence.*
- *Deduct 3 points if student did not choose one of the three options listed.*

- **Write one sentence for which option you think would be most effective in promoting learning here:**

- *Deduct 3 points if this sentence does not deal with effectiveness.*
- *Deduct up to 2 points for a weak justification, depending on how poor it is.*
- *Deduct 1 point if more than one sentence.*
- *Deduct 3 points if the student did not choose one of the three options listed.*

Exercise 6.2: Developing Public Policy Alternatives

Your Total Score: _____ (Maximum: 33 points)

A. Using **information from a book, website, or article**, describe a public policy alternative to the existing policy that deals with the societal problem identified in Exercise 5.1. The information can refer to any geographic area or governmental level.

- The policy must be at the local level and be reasonable in terms of the criteria discussed in Step 2 on pp. 73-74 of the *Maxwell Manual*.
- To receive credit for this exercise, the alternative must be able to be implemented by one or more agencies that have direct authority in the geographic location your policy targets.
- Rate the feasibility and effectiveness of your alternative using the terms “high,” “medium,” or “low,” and justify your rating. (8 points)
- Internal citation needed for all policy alternatives.

Part A score: _____

• **Description of Policy Alternative #1 and the local government agency responsible for implementation here:**

- *Deduct 2 points if the student quotes from their source and a citation is missing from this exercise. Deduct 1 point from WRT if the citation is incorrect.*
- *Deduct 2 points for each of the following:*
 - *If the alternative has already been implemented exactly as stated at the targeted geographic location.*
 - *If it does not address the problem stated in 5.1*
 - *If the alternative is not at least somewhat feasible and reasonable*
 - *If the government agency is not stated.*
 - *If the alternative is at the wrong geographic level.*
 - *If the alternative can't be implemented by an agency with direct authority over the targeted geographic location.*

• **Identify your source of information and explain how it helped you formulate your policy here:**

- *Deduct 2 points if the source of information is not a published, book, article, or website.*
- *Deduct 2 points from the References page if the source does not appear.*
- *Deduct 1 point if explanation is poor.*

• **Rate Policy Alternative #1 Effectiveness here:**

- *Deduct 2 points each time effectiveness and feasibility are confused, for up to 6 points.*

- *Deduct 2 points if no rating.*
- *Deduct 1 point from organization each time the rating is on the following line and not after the colon.*

- **Justification:**

- *Deduct 2 points for each tautology.*
- *Deduct 1-2 points for a weak justification, depending on how poor it is.*

- **Rate Policy Alternative #1 Feasibility here:**

- **Justification:**

- *Follow the same instructions as for policy effectiveness.*
- *Deduct 2 points for the feasibility rating if it is for a policy already in effect in the geographic location. Feasibility cannot be estimated if the policy is already implemented.*

B. Using information you received through an interview with a player, stakeholder, or expert, describe a public policy alternative to the existing policy that deals with the societal problem identified in Exercise 5.1. The information can refer to any geographic area or governmental level.

- Follow the instructions from Part A. (8 points)

Part B score: _____

- *Follow all of the instructions from Part A, but deduct 2 points if the source of information does not come from an interview with a player, stakeholder, or expert.*
- *DO NOT deduct 2 points from the References page if this source is not listed there—personal communication is only cited internally.*
- *Deduct 2 points if there is no internal citation.*
- *Deduct 1 point from writing if the internal citation is incorrect.*

- **Description of Policy Alternative #2 and the local government agency responsible for implementation including a quote from a player, stakeholder, or expert here:**

- **Identify your source of information and explain how it helped you formulate your policy here:**

- **Rate Policy Alternative #2 Effectiveness here:**

- **Justification:**

- **Rate Policy Alternative #2 Feasibility here:**

- **Justification:**

C. Using **any source of information**, describe a public policy alternative to the existing policy that deals with the societal problem identified in Exercise 5.1. The information can refer to any geographic area or governmental level.

- Follow the instructions from Part A. (8 points)

Part C score: _____

- *Follow all of the instructions from Part A, but deduct 2 points if any other source of information is not used.*
- *Deduct 2 points if the student includes a quote and there is no internal citation.*
- *Deduct 1 point from writing if the internal citation is incorrect.*
- *Deduct 2 points from the References page if the source used in this alternative is not present, unless it is a personal communication.*

- **Description of Policy Alternative #3 and the local government agency responsible for implementation here:**

- **Identify your source of information and explain how it helped you formulate your policy here:**

- **Rate Policy Alternative #3 Effectiveness here:**

- **Justification:**

- **Rate Policy Alternative #3 Feasibility here:**

- **Justification:**

D. Based only on your ratings and justifications in Parts A-C, summarize your preferred policy alternative clearly and coherently in no more than 5 sentences. (9 points)

Part D score: _____

- **In no more than 5 sentences, state your preferred policy and explain why it is superior to the other two alternatives by comparing the feasibility and effectiveness of each here:**

- *Deduct 1 point if the preferred policy is not stated.*
- *Deduct 2 points every time the feasibility or effectiveness of a non-selected policy is not compared to the selected policy.*
- *Deduct up to 3 points if the paragraph does not make clear why the chosen policy is superior (don't be too picky).*
- *Justifications may be repeated from Part A.*
- *Deduct 5 points if more than 5 sentences.*

Exercise 6.3: Finding Legislation on Your Topic

Your Total Score: _____ (Maximum: 10 points)

A. Using the Congressional Information Service (CIS Index) reference material or the web address, <http://thomas.loc.gov>, find a piece of federal legislation related to your societal problem (not necessarily your proposed policy). Attach a copy of the first page of the legislation. (5 points)

Part A score: _____

- *Deduct 5 points if first page is not attached.*
- *Deduct 5 points if legislation is not federal.*

• **Record the full search statement you used here:**

- *Deduct 2 points if search statement is completely irrelevant or obviously wrong.*

• **Write one complete sentence on how the bill is related to your societal problem here:**

- *Deduct 1-3 points if the sentence does not show how the bill is related to the societal problem, depending on how poor the sentence is.*
- *Deduct 3 points if answer is not in one complete sentence.*

B. Using the New York State web address (www.state.ny.us) or the New York State Assembly or Senate home pages (<http://assembly.state.ny.us> or <http://senate.state.ny.us>), find a piece of legislation related to your societal problem (not necessarily your proposed policy). Attach a copy of the first page of the legislation. (5 points)

Part B score: _____

- *Deduct 5 points if first page is not attached.*
- *Deduct 5 points if legislation is not from New York State or from a different state then the rest of their module.*

• **Record the full search statement you used here:**

- *Deduct 2 points if search statement is completely irrelevant or obviously wrong.*

• **Write one complete sentence on how the bill is related to your societal problem here:**

- *Deduct 1-3 points if the sentence does not show how the bill is related to the societal problem, depending on how poor the sentence is.*
- *Deduct 3 points if answer is not in one complete sentence.*

Exercise 6.4: References

Your Total Score: _____ (Maximum: 10 points)

- Prepare a list of references that includes all sources for this module.
 - Follow the APA format.
 - Include all sources used in the exercises.
 - **Start References on the next line or on the next page:**
- *Deduct 2 points for each missing reference. References needed for exercises 5.2, 5.3, 5.5, 5.6, 6.2.*
 - *Deduct 1 point for each reference error, but do not take off points more than once for the same mistake.*
 - *Deduct 1 point for each format error, but do not take off points more than once for the same mistake.*
 - *If any of the following are missing, one formatting error point should be deducted:*
 - *The word “References” should be centered at the top of the References page, with no underline, quotes, etc.*
 - *The page should be double spaced.*
 - *The entries should be in alphabetical order.*
 - *The first line of each entry should begin at the left margin, and each successive line should be indented.*